

REPORT TO THE NORTHERN AREA PLANNING COMMITTEE

Date of Meeting	30th March 2011		
Application Number	N10/03043/FUL & N10/03044/LBC		
Site Address	The Old Vicarage, Church Walk, Ashton Keynes		
Proposal	Extension to coach house in curtilage of The Old Vicarage (FUL) Internal & external alterations and extension to coach house (LBC)		
Applicant	Mr R Laws		
Town/Parish Council	Ashton Keynes		
Electoral Division	Minety	Unitary Member	Carole Soden
Grid Ref	404464 194176		
Type of application	Full and Listed Building Consent		
Case Officer	Caroline Ridgwell	01249 706 639	caroline.ridgwell@wiltshire.gov.uk

Reason for the application being considered by Committee

This application has been referred to the Northern Area Planning Committee at the request of Councillor Soden so that the Members can consider the scale and design of the development and whether there would be any environmental or highway impact.

1. Purpose of report

To consider the above applications and to recommend that planning permission and listed building consent be REFUSED.

2. Report summary

The main issues in the consideration of this application are as follows:

- Principle of development
- Impact on the listed building, visual amenity and landscape character
- Impact on archaeology
- Impact on Highways
- Impact on Flood Zone 3

The application has generated no objections from Ashton Keynes Parish Council.

3. Site Description

The Old Vicarage, which is Grade II listed, is a detached building set behind a wall on Church Walk, just off the High Road, Ashton Keynes. The vehicular entrance to the site is more or less opposite the bridge that connects the two sides of Church Walk. There is a substantial garden surrounding the property and a large area of agricultural land beyond. The coach house, garage and store, which are each also detached buildings, are located at the south west corner of the domestic curtilage against a boundary with the playing fields. The area is known to be of archaeological interest and it is also in Flood Zone 3.

4. Relevant Planning History		
Application Number	Proposal	Decision
09/01507/LBC	Extensions to house, coach house & garage, plus internal alterations	Permitted
09/01508/FUL	Extensions to house, coach house & garage	Permitted
09/01314/LBC	Extension to main house, coach house & garages	Withdrawn
09/01142/FUL	Extension to main house, coach house & garages	Withdrawn
N77/0376/F	Conversion of coach house to living quarters	Permitted
N77/1272/F	Extension to existing garage to form double garage	Permitted

5. Proposal

The proposal is to carry out internal and external alterations and extend the coach house by more than double the existing footprint, adding a gate between the gable end of the new extension and the existing double garage so that the coach house is linked to the exiting garage and a garden area specifically for the use of the coach house occupants would be created adjacent to the garage and on the site of the store.

External alterations to the coach house include: a large flat roofed single storey extension to the north elevation which will be built off the boundary wall with the neighbouring site; a new rooflight added to the East (rear) elevation; the pitch of the dormer windows will be increased; all the window openings enlarged and windows replaced, the window in the former coach entrance will be replaced with fully glazed concertina doors; and the timber side door replaced.

The flat roof will be a single ply membrane covered with gravel and lead upstands. The west elevation, which will be visible from the main house, will have three large fully glazed doors adjacent to the existing coach house and vertical cedar wood cladding along the remaining three quarters of the elevation. The section connecting to the coach house will be deeper than the longer section that connects up with the garages.

Internal alterations to the coach house include removal of all the ground floor internal partitions, replacing and repositioning the modern staircase, rearranging the modern internal partitions on the first floor and the addition of a second bathroom on the first floor. The existing kitchen, which is in the single storey lean-to will be removed so that the lean-to becomes a boot room. The entire ground floor of the coach house will become a living/dining area. The existing ground floor window at the north east of the building will be blocked in and the ground floor window on the north west will be enlarged to create a door through to the extension. The extension will house the kitchen, two cloakrooms, boiler room /store and office. The north elevation of the extension, which will serve the office, is to be full height glazed doors. A new gate will be erected between the north west corner of the extension and the garage.

6. Planning Policy

Central government planning policy PPS5 and PPS25

The site is a grade II listed building, lies within a conservation area, an area of archaeological interest and flood zone 3.

North Wiltshire Local Plan: policies C3; HE1, HE4, HE5, HE8 and T3

7. Consultations

Ashton Keynes Parish Council – No objections in principle, but if a flat roof to the extension is deemed acceptable the finish should be of traditional materials, e.g. lead.

Highways – Due to the location of the existing access in a cul de sac, the proposals are not likely to create a significant or additional highway hazard. However, two car parking spaces and turning for the coach house should be provided within the site. A suggested condition is therefore to be added should any consent be granted.

Archaeology – The proposal is situated within the medieval settlement of Ashton Keynes and any development here is likely to encounter archaeological deposits. During an archaeological investigation in 2003 in the adjoining property, rare remains of a possible Saxon hut were revealed. A suggested condition is therefore to be added should any consent be granted.

The Environment Agency – Standing advice recommends that the development would be acceptable subject to appropriate “flood proof” building criteria incorporated into the scheme.

8. Publicity

The application was advertised by site notice, press advert and neighbour consultation. No letters of objection or support were received.

9. Planning Considerations

Principle of the development

The coach house is neatly proportioned, constructed of natural stone, detached and set well back in the site beyond the house and against the boundary wall with the neighbouring property and playing fields. The site is very close to the position of the medieval village of Ashton Keynes as well as Saxon finds. The floor space in this coach house is very reasonable for an ancillary building and consent was granted in 2010 to extend the garages to create an office, store and cloakroom. There is no justification for a large single storey extension on the north elevation, which will possibly undermine the stability of the boundary wall, be visible from the main listed building and from the playing fields behind the site. It will have a harmful affect on the character, appearance and setting of the listed building and Ashton Keynes conservation area. This would be contrary to guidance given in PPS5 policies HE6 and HE7, plus policies HE1 and HE4 of the North Wiltshire Local Plan 2011.

Impact on the listed building, visual amenity and landscape character

This former coach house, which is probably C19, is a compact building which still clearly shows its original use through the scale of the building and details of the openings. The design of the existing windows and doors which were inserted into existing openings when the building was converted to residential use in the 1980s may not be the most suitable. New openings are being created resulting in the loss of historic fabric, rather than using existing openings. The proposals include removal of all the ground floor partitions, removing any remnants of the original floor plan and also the means of support for the first floor.

The proposed extension will result in the irreversible loss of historic fabric from the gable on the north elevation and on the areas where windows are to be enlarged, and it will double the original footprint of this building with an extraordinarily large, inappropriate and unjustified extension. No evidence has been provided to demonstrate that the boundary wall with the playing field is capable of being used to build onto.

The extension, which will be connected to the existing double garages by means of a new gate, will be visible from the house and the playing fields. This will alter the relationship between the previously detached ancillary buildings so that they become one conjoined complex. This would be contrary to guidance given in PPS 5 policies HE6, HE7 and HE10, plus policies HE1 and HE4 of the North Wiltshire Local Plan 2011.

Impact on archaeology

The proposal site is located within the area of medieval settlement of Ashton Keynes and therefore any development here is likely to encounter archaeological deposits. Rare remains of a possible Saxon hut were found during an archaeological investigation in the adjoining property in 2003, so there is a strong possibility that the proposal site also contains these very important remains. Should this be the case, any development would necessitate the disturbance and removal of archaeological remains, and should permission be granted a condition to secure archaeological investigation would be necessary.

Impact on Highways

Providing two dedicated parking spaces and turning for cars associated with the coach house within the site will alleviate concerns from highways and is in accordance with policy T3 of the North Wiltshire Local Plan 2011.

Impact on Flood Zone 3

Although the location of the proposed development is in Flood zone 3, the Flood Risk Assessment submitted with the application states that according to local anecdotal evidence the site has never been flooded. However, any development would be designed and built according to the latest appropriate flood proof building criteria at the time of construction. This would comply with the Environment Agency's standing advice.

10. Conclusion

The scale, design and materials of the proposed extension will have an extremely detrimental impact on the historic fabric of the building, the setting, character and appearance of the listed building and the amenity of the Ashton Keynes conservation area. The internal alterations have not been supported with any structural information and may jeopardise the structural integrity of the first floor. No structural information has been supplied to demonstrate that the existing boundary wall with the plating field is capable of either being built off or being built against, without undermining the stability of the wall.

11. Recommendation

Planning Permission be REFUSED for the following reason:

1. Due to the scale, design, materials of the extension and loss of historic and archaeological fabric and material, the proposals would be exceedingly harmful the character, appearance and setting of the listed building and amenity of the conservation area. These proposals would be contrary to advice contained within the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 and PPS 5 and contrary to policies C3, HE1, HE4, HE6 and HE8 of the North Wiltshire Local Plan 2011.

Listed Building Consent be REFUSED for the following reason:

1. Due to the scale, design, materials of the extension, loss of historic fabric, alteration to the relationship between ancillary buildings and potential harm to the structural integrity of the coach house and boundary wall, the proposals would be exceedingly harmful the character, appearance and setting of the listed building. These proposals would be contrary to advice contained within the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 and PPS 5 and contrary to policies C3, HE1 and HE4 of the North Wiltshire Local Plan 2011.

